

Northwest History Consortium

Makah Treaty Decision

Joyce Arnold
3rd and 4th Grades

National Standard

Era 4: Expansion and Reform (1801 – 1861) / Standard 1

Standard 1: United States territorial expansion between 1801 and 1861, and how it affected relations with external powers and Native Americans

Washington State Standards

Social Studies EALR 4.1: Understands how territory and treaty-making help define an era in Washington State history

Social Studies EALR 4.3: Understands that there are multiple perspectives and interpretations of historical events

BACKGROUND (OPTIONAL)

Students will have been working for several weeks within a simulation of early 19th century Makah tribal life. Throughout the simulation they will have used print and online materials (some listed below) to access details needed to recreate a Makah village in the classroom. They will have experienced some key events in Makah history—encounter with European traders, disease, interaction with local settlers, etc.

At this point in the simulation, a guest will role-play Isaac Stevens, and the Makah will be confronted with a problem—whether or not to sign a treaty with the US Government. Students will be invited to pre-write a recommendation based on their personal experiences as a “Makah” and will look for primary or secondary evidence to support or alter their position before preparing a final position paper.

SCENARIO

You are a Makah tribal elder in 1855. Although you continue to live a traditional life of whaling, fishing, and hunting, your tribe has dwindled in recent years and some of the old ways have been lost. In the last ten years Europeans have begun to settle around the shores of Puget Sound, and some have even staked claims on the coasts and rivers of the Olympic Peninsula.

A US Navy ship anchors offshore, and an escort rows American diplomat Isaac Stevens to shore where he invites leaders of local villages to meet with him. Stevens pulls out a document and reads from it. Although the translation is rough, it seems that he is offering protection to your tribe from encroaching European settlements and competing northern tribes. He offers new technology such as metal kettles for frying out oil, strong, ready-made fishing line, agricultural and industrial schools for your children, a blacksmith, a doctor, and \$30,000 a year. In exchange your tribe will need to relocate to a reservation several miles away, along with other neighboring tribes.

Members of the tribe have different opinions as to how to respond. The chief elder has asked to confer with you and the other elders before making a decision.

Northwest History Consortium

Makah Treaty Decision

TASK(S)

You need to prepare a statement advising your chief as to whether or not the tribe should sign the treaty.

Provide at least three arguments to support your position. Elaborate your arguments with examples to help your chief understand how important these reasons are. Consider what changes would occur if the tribe agrees to the treaty and if those changes would be good or bad for the tribe. Also consider if any problems may occur if the tribe doesn't agree to the treaty.

RESOURCES

Internet

Copy of Treaty

“Treaty with the Makah, 1855.” 31 Jan. 1855. University of Washington Libraries Digital Collections. ©1997 – 2010. Seattle, WA. 11 May 2010 <http://content.lib.washington.edu/curriculumpackets/treaties/Treaty_with_Makah_1855.pdf>.

Glimpse of Reservation Life

Smith, E. B. “Report of the Commissioner of Indian Affairs.” 5 Sept. 1874. University of Washington Libraries Digital Collections (American Indians of the Pacific Northwest Collection). ©1997 – 2010. Seattle, WA. 11 May 2010 <<http://content.lib.washington.edu/cdm4/document.php?CISOROOT=/lctext&CISOPTR=644&REC=6&CISOSHOW=3684>>.

Winnemucca, Sarah. “An Indian Girl’s Letter. What the Daughter of a Chief Writes to Commissioner Parker—Treatment of her People in Nevada.” 15 April 1870. New York Times. 17 April 1870. ©2010. New York Times. New York, NY. 11 May 2010 <http://query.nytimes.com/mem/archive-free/pdf?_r=1&res=940CE3DC143BE63BBC4F52DFB266838B669FDE>.

Life of the Makah

“Makah Cultural and Research Center Online Museum: Seasonal Activities.” University of Washington Libraries Digital Collections (Olympic Peninsula Community Museum). ©2003 – 2010. Seattle, WA. 11 May 2010 <<http://content.lib.washington.edu/cmpweb/exhibits/makah/default2.html>>.

“Our History.” Makah.com. © Makah Cultural and Research Center and Washington State Historical Society. Neah Bay, WA. 11 May 2010 <<http://www.makah.com/history.html>>.

Northwest History Consortium

Makah Treaty Decision

Overview of Stakeholders

“A History of Treaty-Making and Reservations on the Olympic Peninsula: Territorial Context.” University of Washington Libraries Digital Collections (Center for the Study of the Pacific Northwest). ©1997 – 2010. Seattle, WA. <<http://content.lib.washington.edu/curriculumpackets/treaties/territorial.html>>

“Indian Wars of 1855-56.” Washington State Historical Society (Washingtonhistoryonline.org). Tacoma, WA. 11 May 2010 <<http://washingtonhistoryonline.org/leschi/indianwars.htm>>.

“Settlement Areas [map].” University of Washington Libraries Digital Collections (Olympic Peninsula Community Museum). ©2003 – 2010. Seattle, WA. 11 May 2010 <<http://content.lib.washington.edu/cmpweb/exhibits/homesteading/settlements.html>>.

ASSESSMENT

Position Paper Rubric

	1	2	3	4
Reasoned Position	States a position, but reasons provided are not logically related to the position.	States a position and provides one logically related reason to support the position	States a position and provides two logically related reasons to support the position	States a position and provides three logically related reasons to support the position
Elaborations that help convince the reader	Elaborates one reason with less well-extended examples	Elaborates one reason with extended example, or two with less well-extended examples	Elaborates two reasons with extended examples, or three with less well-extended examples	Elaborates each reason with extended examples
Evidence Sources	Gives one relevant source with incomplete citation.	References one relevant source with a complete citation, or two with incomplete citations.	References two relevant sources with complete citations, or three with incomplete citations.	References three relevant sources with complete citations (title, author, type of source, and date of each source).

Northwest History Consortium

Makah Treaty Decision

REFERENCES/CITATIONS

Arnold, Joyce. "Makah Treaty Decision." NWESD Organization. 2008. Anacortes, WA. 11 May 2010 <<http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/4.1MakahTreatyDecision.Arnold.3-4.pdf>>.

Arnold, Joyce. "Position Paper Rubric." NWESD Organization. 2008. Anacortes, WA. 11 May 2010 <<http://www.nwesd.org/1510101216191755740/lib/1510101216191755740/4.1MakahTreatyDecision.Arnold.3-4.pdf>>.

"History Standards for Grades 5-12 United States." UCLA National Center for History in the Schools. 2005. Los Angeles, CA. 11 May 2010 <<http://nchs.ucla.edu/standards/standardsk-4.html>>.

OSPI. "Social Studies Essential Learning Requirements: Recommended Grade-by-Grade Sequence for Grade Level Expectations – K-12." Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction. 2009. Olympia, WA. 11 May 2010 <http://standards.ospi.k12.wa.us/EalrsPubDocs/GradeSpecificDocument/Social%20Studies/GLEs-Social_Studies-Grade4.doc>.