

# Northwest History Consortium

## Health Care Reform

Elizabeth Zylstra  
4<sup>th</sup> - 5th Grade

### National Standard

**Era 10: Contemporary United States (1968 to the present) / Standard 1**

*Standard 1: Recent developments in foreign and domestic politics*

### Washington State Standards

*EALR 1: Civics - The student understands and applies knowledge of government, law, politics, and the nation's fundamental documents to make decisions about local, national, and international issues and to demonstrate thoughtful, participatory citizenship.*

*EALR 4: History - The student understands and applies knowledge of historical thinking, chronology, eras, turning points, major ideas, individuals, and themes in local, Washington State, tribal, United States, and world history in order to evaluate how history shapes the present and future.*

## BACKGROUND

### **Pre-QuickWrite**

Have student write everything they know about the 2010 United States health care bill and health care debate.

### **Background**

Health care reform is a debate that has been going on in the United States for decades. The following is a timeline (Reference citations #1, #2) of some of the highlights of this historical debate:

#### 1901 – 1909

Although President Roosevelt believed in health care reform because he felt our country would not be strong if its people were poor or sick, most of the reform during this time took place outside of the government.

#### 1917 - 1930

The California Social Insurance Commission proposed legislation on health insurance, however, opponents associated compulsory health insurance as Communist and it was not taken seriously. Doctors, businesses, and labor opposed compulsory health care as well.

#### 1930s

Health care costs began to rise and focus on health care reform shifted to expanding access to medical care.

#### 1935

Franklin D. Roosevelt pushed the Social Security Bill. However, health insurance was not included in this bill because it was felt that the whole bill would be threatened; unemployment insurance and old-age benefits took priority.

#### 1943

The Wagner Bill was introduced in 1943 and included compulsory national health insurance funded by payroll taxes. This bill was reintroduced every session for 14 years, but it never passed Congress.

## Northwest History Consortium

### Health Care Reform

#### 1945 – 1953

President Truman's plan for national health insurance took the direction of a single universal comprehensive plan for all people in the United States, not just the working class. He refuted the fact that this was "socialized medicine" and dropped the funeral benefit that was instrumental in the defeat of national insurance during the Progressive Era. Congress had mixed reaction to Truman's plan. Some thought it was socialism. The American Medical Association said it would make slaves of doctors. In 1946, Republicans took control of Congress and had no desire to pass national health care. Compromises were made during this time, but a single health insurance system did not get passed. Instead private insurance was available to those who could afford it and public welfare services were available for the poor. Therefore, advocates of public health care insurance made a more modest proposal of hospital insurance for the elderly, and we had the start of Medicare.

#### 1965

President Johnson signed into law the Medicare and Medicaid legislation. This included the Democratic proposal for comprehensive health insurance for the elderly and a revised Republican plan for subsidized physician insurance.

#### 1970 – 1974

Inflation and health care costs were growing in the United States. Senator Kennedy (Democrat) had a proposal for national health insurance which was responded to in opposition by President (Republican) Nixon's Comprehensive Health Insurance Plan (CHIP). Other Congressional members wrote other plans. Nothing was decided and health reform was lost under the Watergate hearings and Nixon's resignation.

#### 1975 – 1979

President Carter had health reform as a priority for his administration, but implementation was delayed due to an economic recession.

#### 1981 - 1982

Some adjustments were made in Medicaid (additional payments to hospitals were designated and states were required to pay nursing home rates that were more appropriate). Medicaid was expanded to include children with disabilities.

#### 1996

Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA) adjusted the use of pre-existing conditions, set regulations for privacy of medical records, and regulated tax obligations for long-term care insurance.

#### 2002

President Bush established the Health Center Growth Initiative, which increased the number of community health centers.

#### 2005

More adjustments to premiums and benefits were made to Medicaid in the Deficit Reduction Act of 2005.

## Northwest History Consortium

### Health Care Reform

2006

The Medicare Part D Drug benefit was established. Massachusetts passed a provision of health care coverage for all their residents. After two years of this additional coverage, Massachusetts cut their uninsured rate in half.

2010

President Obama signed into law the Patient Protection Affordable Care Act.

“The historic health reform legislation requires that all individuals have health insurance beginning in 2014.

- ✓ The poorest will be covered under a Medicaid expansion.
- ✓ Those with low and middle incomes who do not have access to affordable coverage through their jobs will be able to purchase coverage with federal subsidies through new "American Health Benefit Exchanges."
- ✓ Employers are not mandated to provide health benefits, however large businesses whose employees receive insurance subsidies will pay penalties. Small businesses will be able to access more plans through a separate Exchange.
- ✓ Health plans will not be allowed to deny coverage to people for any reason, including their health status, nor can they charge more because of a person's health or gender. Young adults will now have the option of being covered under their parents' plan up to age 26.” (Reference Citation #2, 2010 on timeline.)

Discuss what political cartoons represent, using one or both of these “New Deal” cartoons as models:

"The New Deal at 75: When Art, Culture, and Government Intersected." Library of Congress. 2010. Washington, DC. 12 October 2010 <<http://www.loc.gov/loc/lcib/0804/detail/newdeal02.html>>.

May, Rex F. "New Deal." CartoonStock, Ltd. 2010. Bath, United Kingdom. 12 October 2010 <[http://www.cartoonstock.com/cartoonview.asp?search=site&catref=rman4378&MA\\_Category=&ANDkeyword=New+Deal&ORkeyword=&TITLEkeyword=&NEGATIVEkeyword=>](http://www.cartoonstock.com/cartoonview.asp?search=site&catref=rman4378&MA_Category=&ANDkeyword=New+Deal&ORkeyword=&TITLEkeyword=&NEGATIVEkeyword=>)>.

Or choose a cartoon from <<http://www.cagle.com>> as models. (Preview these cartoons first as some may not be suitable for educational purposes.) The teacher may want to choose a cartoon that highlights a topic that has already been discussed in the classroom so that students have a foundation of the issue being depicted by the cartoon.

Cagle, Daryl. "Daryl Cagle's Political Cartoonist's Index." ©2010. Cagle.Com. New York, NY. 12 October 2010 <<http://www.cagle.com/>>.

Talk about the elements of political cartoons as students will be creating modern day cartoons depicting our current health care bill/debate for this PBL. An entire lesson on political cartoons might be helpful before this PBL is even introduced.

# Northwest History Consortium

## Health Care Reform

"How to Make Political Cartoons." eHow.Com. ©1999 - 2010. Bellevue, WA. 13 October 2010 <[http://www.ehow.com/how\\_4472287\\_make-political-cartoons.html](http://www.ehow.com/how_4472287_make-political-cartoons.html)>.

"Teacher Guide: Elements of Political Cartoons." University of Wisconsin (Green Bay). 2010. Green Bay, WI. 13 October 2010 <[http://www.uwgb.edu/teachingushistory/images/pdfs/2004\\_lessons/war\\_media\\_elements\\_political\\_cartoon.pdf](http://www.uwgb.edu/teachingushistory/images/pdfs/2004_lessons/war_media_elements_political_cartoon.pdf)>.

"Lesson 5: Analyzing Political Cartoons." Lincoln Log Cabin Organization. ©2010. Lerna, IL. 13 October 2010 <<http://www.lincolnlogcabin.org/education-kits/Abraham-Lincoln-Lesson-Plans/Lesson-5.pdf>>.

Also, review the You Decide CBA Rubric (see assessment section) with students so that they understand vocabulary and expectations.

### PROBLEM

In 2010 Congress passed an historical health care reform bill. Some felt that this bill was long overdue, and they are happy about what this means for the country. Others felt that the bill was not what the majority of the American people wanted, but it was passed for political reasons. Was this bill really the will of the American people? How does health care reform speak to the rights and responsibilities of Americans? How does this new health care law affect the common good of all people?

### SCENARIO

It is June of 2010 in the United States and you are just beginning your career in creating political cartoons. You have been hired by the Seattle Times to create political cartoons that reflect current trends or topical issues in our country. Your first assignment is to create a cartoon that addresses health care reform in the United States.

Our country has had health care reform debates for decades. President Obama signed a controversial health care bill into law on March 23, 2010. People are still talking about this new law; and although you have your own beliefs about these new health regulations, you want to make sure you research the topic and get different points of view about how people around the country feel about this law before you create your cartoon.

### TASK

Design a political cartoon that shows at least two different sides of the health care debate in the United States in 2010. Also, include a one-paragraph narrative of what your cartoon portrays.

## Northwest History Consortium

### Health Care Reform

#### RESOURCES

##### Internet

Brown, Carrie Budoff. "Both Sides Push Health Debate myths." 15 February 2010. Politico. ©2010 Capitol News Company LLC. Arlington, VA. 13 October 2010 <<http://www.politico.com/news/stories/0210/33011.html>>.

Courson, Paul. "Conservatives Rally Against Health Care Bill." 16 March 2010. Cable News Network (CNN). ©2010 Cable News Network. Atlanta, GA. 13 October 2010 <<http://www.cnn.com/2010/POLITICS/03/16/health.care.protests/index.html>>.

Edenloft, Tracy. "New Health Care Bill Facts: Pros and Cons of New Health Care Reform Bill Explained." 24 March 2010. World Correspondents. ©2010 World Correspondents. Hicksville, NY. 13 October 2010 <<http://www.worldcorrespondents.com/new-health-care-bill-facts-pros-and-cons-of-new-health-care-reform-bill-explained/882049>>.

"Health Care 2010: Tracking the National Debate on Health Care System Overhaul." 2010. The Washington Post. ©2010 The Washington Post Company. Washington, DC. 13 October 2010 <<http://voices.washingtonpost.com/health-care-reform/>>.

Herszenhorn, David M. and Pear, Robert. "Health Vote is Done, But Partisan Debate Rages On." 22 March 2010. The New York Times. ©2010 The New York Times. New York, NY. 13 October 2010 <[http://www.nytimes.com/2010/03/23/health/policy/23health.html?\\_r=1](http://www.nytimes.com/2010/03/23/health/policy/23health.html?_r=1)>.

Knufken, Drea. "9 Pros and Cons of the New Health-Care Reform Bill." 22 March 2010. Business Pundit. ©2006 - 2010 SeaWave Technology. Cape May County, NJ. 13 October 2010 <<http://www.businesspundit.com/the-pros-and-cons-of-the-new-health-care-reform-bill/>>.

Nguyen, Simon. "Pros and Cons of Health Care Reform Law." 13 April 2010. Associated Content. ©2010 Associated Content, Inc. Denver, CO. 13 October 2010 <[http://www.associatedcontent.com/article/2891886/pros\\_and\\_cons\\_of\\_health\\_care\\_reform.html?cat=9](http://www.associatedcontent.com/article/2891886/pros_and_cons_of_health_care_reform.html?cat=9)>.

"The President's Proposal." 22 February 2010. WhiteHouse.Gov. 2010. Washington, DC. 13 October 2010 <<http://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/summary-presidents-proposal.pdf>>.

##### Primary Sources

Check local and school libraries for print reference documents on this topic.

Look for the health care document itself and see if some excerpts can be printed out.

"H.R. 3590 Bill Summary and Status." 2010. Library of Congress. 2010. Washington, DC. 13 October 2010 <<http://thomas.loc.gov/cgi-bin/bdquery/D?d111:5:./temp/~bdeeKb::/home/LegislativeData.php>>.

# Northwest History Consortium

## Health Care Reform

"H.R. 4872 Bill Summary and Status." 2010. Library of Congress. 2010. Washington, DC. 13 October 2010 <<http://thomas.loc.gov/cgi-bin/bdquery/z?d111:H.R.4872:>>.

### Professional Political Cartoons

After the PBL, some of the following political cartoons could be displayed as discussion starters to conclude and/or review this topic. Students might appreciate these cartoons more after they have conducted research on this topic and made cartoons of their own.

<p>Fell, Paul. "Health Care Reform." September 2008. <u>Prairie Fire: The Progressive Voice of the Great Plains</u>. ©2007 - 2010. Lincoln, NE. 14 Oct. 2010 &lt;<a href="http://www.prairiefirenewspaper.com/2008/09/health-care-reform">http://www.prairiefirenewspaper.com/2008/09/health-care-reform</a>&gt;.</p>	<p>Toles. "Health Care Plan." 23 March 2010. <u>TQN (SourceForge)</u>. ©1999 - 2010 Geeknet, Inc. Mountain View, CA. 14 Oct. 2010 &lt;<a href="http://0.tqn.com/d/politicalhumor/1/0/W/K3/Health-Care-Plan.jpg">http://0.tqn.com/d/politicalhumor/1/0/W/K3/Health-Care-Plan.jpg</a>&gt;.</p>
<p>Toles. "Health Care Reform - Passes." 23 March 2010. <u>TQN (SourceForge)</u>. ©1999 - 2010 Geeknet, Inc. Mountain View, CA. 27 Oct. 2010 &lt;<a href="http://0.tqn.com/d/politicalhumor/1/0/I/K/3/HCR-Passes.jpg">http://0.tqn.com/d/politicalhumor/1/0/I/K/3/HCR-Passes.jpg</a>&gt;.</p>	<p>Toles. "Obama Sings - Health Care Reform." ©Matson. St. Louis Post Dispatch. <u>TQN (SourceForge)</u>. ©1999 - 2010 Geeknet, Inc. Mountain View, CA. 27 Oct. 2010 &lt;<a href="http://0.tqn.com/d/politicalhumor/1/0/K/K/Obama-Sings-HCR.jpg">http://0.tqn.com/d/politicalhumor/1/0/K/K/Obama-Sings-HCR.jpg</a>&gt;.</p>
<p>Galt, John. "Detailed Analysis of Democrat's Health Care Reform Bill." 22 Sept. 2009. <u>Good Sense Media</u>. ©2008 - 2010. [location unknown]. 27 Oct. 2010 &lt;<a href="http://goodsensehealthcare.blogspot.com/2009/09/detailed-analysis-of-democrats-health.html">http://goodsensehealthcare.blogspot.com/2009/09/detailed-analysis-of-democrats-health.html</a>&gt;.</p>	<p>Fitzsimmons, David. "Health Care Reform" from <i>The Arizona Star</i> 2009. <u>Black Commentator</u> (July 23, 2009, Issue 334). ©2002 - 2010. Mullica Hill, NJ. 27 Oct. 2010 &lt;<a href="http://www.blackcommentator.com/334/33_cartoon_healthcare_reform.html">http://www.blackcommentator.com/334/33_cartoon_healthcare_reform.html</a>&gt;.</p>

## ASSESSMENT

### Review

Give groups time to share their political cartoon with the entire class, including a verbal narrative of what they wanted to portray with this cartoon. Then have a debate on the two sides of the issue or do the debate first and then have groups share their cartoons.

### Assessments

1. CBA – You Decide – Washington:  
 "Social Studies Elementary Assessments." 2010. OSPI (Office of the Superintendent of Instruction). 2010. Olympia, WA. 27 Oct. 2010 <<https://www.k12.wa.us/SocialStudies/Assessments/Elementary.aspx>>.
2. "Collaboration rubric." San Diego County Office of Education. ©2010 Board of Education. San Diego, CA. 27 Oct. 2010 <<http://www.sdcoe.k12.ca.us/score/actbank/collaborub.html>>.

## Northwest History Consortium

### Health Care Reform

3. Individual journal reflection about the process.
4. Political cartoon(s) and narrative.
5. Post-QuickWrite about what students know about the 2010 US health care bill and debate.

#### REFERENCES/CITATIONS

- Cagle, Daryl. "Daryl Cagle's Political Cartoonist's Index." ©2010. Cagle.Com. New York, NY. 12 October 2010 <<http://www.cagle.com/>>.
- "Collaboration rubric." San Diego County Office of Education. ©2010 Board of Education. San Diego, CA. 27 Oct. 2010 <<http://www.sdcoe.k12.ca.us/score/actbank/collaborub.html>>.
- "Developing Standards in History for Grades K-4 United States." UCLA National Center for History in the Schools. 2005. Los Angeles, CA. 28 October 2010 <<http://www.sscnet.ucla.edu/nchs/standards/dev-k-4.html>>.
- "History Standards for Grades 5-12 United States." UCLA National Center for History in the Schools. 2005. Los Angeles, CA. 28 October 2010 <<http://www.sscnet.ucla.edu/nchs/standards/us-standards5-12.html>>.
- "How to Make Political Cartoons." eHow.Com. ©1999 - 2010. Bellevue, WA. 13 October 2010 <[http://www.ehow.com/how\\_4472287\\_make-political-cartoons.html](http://www.ehow.com/how_4472287_make-political-cartoons.html)>.
- "Lesson 5: Analyzing Political Cartoons." Lincoln Log Cabin Organization. ©2010. Lerna, IL. 13 October 2010 <<http://www.lincolnlogcabin.org/education-kits/Abraham-Lincoln-Lesson-Plans/Lesson-5.pdf>>.
- May, Rex F. "New Deal." CartoonStock, Ltd. 2010. Bath, United Kingdom. 12 October 2010 <[http://www.cartoonstock.com/cartoonview.asp?search=site&catref=rman4378&MA\\_Category=&ANDkeyword=New+Deal&ORkeyword=&TITLEkeyword=&NEGATIVEkeyword=>](http://www.cartoonstock.com/cartoonview.asp?search=site&catref=rman4378&MA_Category=&ANDkeyword=New+Deal&ORkeyword=&TITLEkeyword=&NEGATIVEkeyword=>)>.
- "The New Deal at 75: When Art, Culture, and Government Intersected." Library of Congress. 2010. Washington, DC. 12 October 2010 <<http://www.loc.gov/loc/lcib/0804/detail/newdeal02.html>>.
- OSPI. "Social Studies Essential Learning Requirements: Recommended Grade-by-Grade Sequence for Grade Level Expectations – K-12." Office of Superintendent of Public Instruction. 2010. Olympia, WA. 28 October 2010 <<http://standards.ospi.k12.wa.us/ComponentListByGrade.aspx?subject=6,GLE&gl=6>>.
- Palmer, MPH, Karen S. "A Brief History: Universal Health Care Efforts in the U.S." Spring 1999. PNHP (Physicians for a National Health Program). ©PNHP 2010. Chicago, IL. 28 October 2010 <[http://www.pnhp.org/facts/a\\_brief\\_history\\_universal\\_health\\_care\\_efforts\\_in\\_the\\_us.php?page=3](http://www.pnhp.org/facts/a_brief_history_universal_health_care_efforts_in_the_us.php?page=3)>.
- "Social Studies Elementary Assessments." 2010. OSPI (Office of the Superintendent of Instruction). 2010. Olympia, WA. 27 Oct. 2010 <<https://www.k12.wa.us/SocialStudies/Assessments/Elementary.aspx>>.
- "Teacher Guide: Elements of Political Cartoons." University of Wisconsin (Green Bay). 2010. Green Bay, WI. 13 October 2010 <[http://www.uwgb.edu/teachingushistory/images/pdfs/2004\\_lessons/war\\_media\\_elements\\_political\\_cartoon.pdf](http://www.uwgb.edu/teachingushistory/images/pdfs/2004_lessons/war_media_elements_political_cartoon.pdf)>.
- "Timeline: History of Health Reform Efforts in the U.S." Kaiser Family Foundation. ©2010 Henry J. Kaiser Family Foundation. Menlo Park, CA. 28 October 2010 <<http://healthreform.kff.org/flash/health-reform-new.html>>.